

---

**From:** vadim1980@gmail.com on behalf of Vadim Lyubashevsky <vadim.lyubash@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, January 02, 2018 11:34 AM  
**To:** pqc-comments  
**Cc:** pqc-forum@list.nist.gov  
**Subject:** OFFICIAL COMMENT: CRYSTALS-DILITHIUM

Dear all,

We are very grateful to Peter Pessl for notifying us of an implementation error in a randomness generator of our NIST submission. The bug was in the function `rej_gamma1m1` in `poly.c` and consisted of accidentally overwriting a variable prior to using it. This function is used for sampling the masking vector  $\gamma$  (line 13 of Figure 4 in the supporting documentation), and the result of the bug was that the same randomness ended up being used for pairs of consecutive coefficients, whereas the specification demands that all the coefficients be independent.

This reuse of randomness can easily be exploited to recover the secret key and we thus emphasize that the software, in the state submitted to NIST, should not be used in any real application.

We fixed the bug in an updated version of the software, which is available from the CRYSTALS website at <https://pq-crystals.org/dilithium/resources.shtml>. On the site, we also re-packaged the NIST submission package to include the updated KAT vectors.

Sincerely,

The CRYSTALS Team